Proposed Scorecard
Career Skills-Builder Student Metric
What are skills-builders?

- Workers who are maintaining and adding to skill-sets required for ongoing employment and career advancement.
- These students do not earn community college certificates or degrees and don’t transfer to a four-year institution.
- Most skills-builder take only one or two CTE courses.
- Most skills-builders are older students, who have had experience in the workforce.
Background

*Expanding ways to show the value of CTE*

- Early college efforts:
  - Completer/Leaver Surveys
- Initial Statewide collaboration:
  - CTE Outcomes Survey
  - CCCCCO “Salary Surfer” and “Wage Tracker”
  - Student Success Scorecard “CTE Completion Rate”
Changing Accountability Metrics

Employment and wages are increasingly being used by state and federal entities for accountability reporting

- Gainful Employment
- Perkins
- WIOA
- Federal College Scorecard
- California Student Aid Commission
- ACCJC
Background

**Input from Researchers and Practitioners**

Two year investigation into how best to capture the successes of “skills-builders” (not just completers)

- VERATAC (Vocational Research and Accountability Committee)
  - Statewide CCCCO advisory committee
Background

National research studies led by economists have found earnings gains for community college students, including non-completers: 5-10% more for each additional year of schooling students complete.

- VanDerLinden (2002)
- Kane and Rouse (1999)
- Ashenfelter and Rouse (1999)
Background

Additional research in California has shown that skills-builders are a substantial portion of the community college student populations and have significant earnings gains.

- Bahr (2013, 2014)
- Bahr & Booth (2013)
- Greaney (2013, 2014)
- VERATAC (2013, 2014)
- Fuller (2013)
Each researcher has conducted multiple analyses, using different research approaches:

- Bahr & Fuller: matching student and wage records and examined behavior, reported goal, completion status
- Greaney: surveys of former students
- Booth: interviews with colleges

All studies had large sample sizes:

- Bahr: 759,489 students
- Fuller: 68,000 students
- Greaney: 11,512 students
- VanDerLinden: 150,000 students
Findings

Within 24 workforce subfields, students in 16 saw significant earnings gains after taking only a couple of courses.

Bahr, 2013
Skills-builders start college with higher earnings compared to completers.

Fuller, 2014
Findings

• **Earnings gains varied by program of study**
  – Some CTE programs see higher returns than others (strong in electronics & electronic technology, weak in health)

• **Earnings gains were significant in many fields**
  – While some disciplines showed no increase or minimal increases, others had median increases ranged from 8-66%

• **Earnings gains varied by type of student**
  – Skills-building benefits students who are over 25
  – Many skills-builders have already been to college (between a quarter and a third had attended a four-year college, about a quarter already hold a community college credential)
Purpose

• Develop a skills-builder metric to be added to the Student Success Scorecard.
• Provide more detailed skills-builder tools in the DataMart and the LaunchBoard.
CTE Metric Challenges

• Identifying a CTE /Vocational student
  – Student stated goal is not reliable
  – Inability to determine student behavior

• Defining success/completion
  – 1-2 vocational courses, leave college
  – Not capturing employment/licensing

• Students not tied to Programs
  – Courses (CCN) are tied to programs (PCN)
Developing CTE Metrics

• Reported student Education Goal not reliable indicator for determining CTE students
• Some threshold of CTE course taking should be established to determine definition
• Perkins CTE Core Indicators report used a definition to develop cohorts
• CTE metric was the first to be used in statewide accountability system (Scorecard)
Threshold for units: 0.5

• Research showed that many skills-builders take only one course.
• Analysis of student records showed that in some disciplines, there were a significant number of students taking fewer than 3 units:
  – 24,336 students took between 0.5 and 3 units, 85% of whom enrolled in public and protective services courses.
  – Students who took between 0.5 and 3 units in public and protective services had earnings gains of $7,219.
Skills Builder Cohort Definition

• Students completes at least one course (.5 units). Some number of these units must be a SAM A, B, or C course (higher level CTE).
• No longer enrolled after 1 year
• Did subsequently not earn an award or transfer to a four-year institution
• Did not fail a CTE course during the academic year
• Wages in both time points (1 year before & 1 year after cohort year)
Skills Building Cohort Descriptives

- N=92,841
  ~26% of total 12-13 exiting CTE students (non-completer)
- Median Age — 29
- Median units earned (12-13 year) — 4
- 44% female/55% male
- 12% Asian, 7% African American, 34% Hispanic, 39% White
- % Vocational courses taken in 12-13 — 71%
Displaying Wage Outcomes

- Individual median change (change 1 year before compared to 1 year after for every individual student)
- Individual median % change
Skills Builder Metric Display

CTE Skills Builder

Skills-builders are workers who are maintaining and adding to skill-sets required for ongoing employment and career advancement.

Median Earnings Gain

$4,431 (15.1%)  N=92,841

*Ten Largest TOP codes displayed